

PROFESSIONAL SERVICE AWARD ANALYSIS

SERVICE: Actuary Services

SERVICE DESCRIPTION: Perform actuary services for the City's Supplemental Retirement and Retiree Medical Plans and to perform additional as needed actuarial services.

VENDOR: Bartel Associates, LLC

OVERALL RANKING: 1

SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS/RATERS: 1. *Public Works Senior Administrative Analyst, Finance Administrative Analyst, Fire Senior Administrative Analyst*

I. MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS REVIEW

- Written Proposal Score: 1,337.50

VENDOR NAME – Minimum Qualifications Review		
<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Total Weighted Score</u>	<u>Maximum Score</u>
<i>Compliance with RFP</i>	70	75
<i>Qualifications</i>	337.5	375
<i>Staff Experience</i>	350	375
<i>Technical Approach</i>	350	375
<i>Cost</i>	110	150
<i>References</i>	120	150
<i>Local Vendor (bonus)</i>	0	15
Total	1,337.5	1,500

II. DUE DILIGENCE REVIEW

- Proposal Ranking:

VENDOR NAME – Summary of Review
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Firm completed OPEB and pension valuations for over 400 California agencies since 2012.• 12 credentialed actuaries on staff.• All 5 staff to be assigned to the project have directly related actuary consulting experience with California cities.• Methodology included in the proposal was thorough and clear and tailored to City of Huntington Beach's needs.• Extensive list of actuarial valuation clients including the cities of Culver City, Long Beach, Orange, Fountain Valley, Hermosa Beach, Beverly Hills, and San Clemente to name a few.

VENDOR NAME – Pricing
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Pricing of \$92,200 for the Supplemental Retirement Plan & Retiree Medical Plan (doesn't included as needed actuarial services)

PROFESSIONAL SERVICE AWARD ANALYSIS

SERVICE: Actuary Services

SERVICE DESCRIPTION: Perform actuary services for the City's Supplemental Retirement and Retiree Medical Plans and to perform additional as needed actuarial services.

VENDOR: Vendor #2

OVERALL RANKING: 2

SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS/RATERS: 1. *Public Works Senior Administrative Analyst, Finance Administrative Analyst, Fire Senior Administrative Analyst*

I. MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS REVIEW

- Written Proposal Score: 1,177.50

VENDOR NAME – Minimum Qualifications Review		
<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Total Weighted Score</u>	<u>Maximum Score</u>
Compliance with RFP	52.5	75
Qualifications	350	375
Staff Experience	250	375
Technical Approach	275	375
Cost	130	150
References	120	150
Local Vendor (bonus)	0	15
Total	1,177.5	1,500

II. DUE DILIGENCE REVIEW

- Proposal Ranking:

VENDOR NAME – Summary of Review
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Large client base around the US including 150 clients in California.• Proposal could have been customized more to the needs of the City of Huntington Beach• 2 full time credentialed staff assigned to the City with over 10 years of experience.• Company founded in 1943 and consists of 9 offices & over 140 employees across the US.• References from City of Costa Mesa, City of Alameda, Turlock Irrigation District, Orange County Fire Authority, and San Diego Association of Governments

VENDOR NAME – Pricing
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Pricing of \$70,600 for the Supplemental Retirement Plan & Retiree Medical Plan (doesn't included as needed actuarial services)