

PROFESSIONAL SERVICE AWARD ANALYSIS

SERVICE: General Liability Claim Third Party Administrator

SERVICE DESCRIPTION: Provide General Liability Claim Administration.

VENDOR: Vendor #1

OVERALL RANKING: 1

SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS/RATERS: 1. City of H.B. Risk Manager 2. City of H.B. Senior Risk Management Analyst 3. City of Huntington Beach Risk Management Specialist 4. City of Huntington Beach Senior Deputy City Attorney

I. MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS REVIEW

- Written Proposal Score: 86.5%

VENDOR No. 1 – Minimum Qualifications Review		
<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Total Weighted Score</u>	<u>Maximum Score</u>
Compliance with RFP	80	100
Understanding of the Project	400	500
Recent Experience	450	500
Clarity	160	200
Price	450	500
References	190	200
Total	1730	2000

II. DUE DILIGENCE REVIEW

- Interview Ranking: 1 (tied for 1st with vendor #2)

Vendor No. 1 – Summary of Review
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Submitted proposal compliant with RFP requirements and clearly written• As incumbent, has excellent understanding of project needs• Experience with City, as well as relevant references excellent

Vendor No. 1 – Pricing
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Pricing is the closest to budgeted amount and lowest of all vendors

PROFESSIONAL SERVICE AWARD ANALYSIS

SERVICE: General Liability Claim Third Party Administrator

SERVICE DESCRIPTION: Provide General Liability Claim Administration.

VENDOR: Vendor #2

OVERALL RANKING: 2

SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS/RATERS: 1. City of H.B. Risk Manager 2. City of H.B. Senior Risk Management Analyst 3. City of Huntington Beach Risk Management Specialist 4. City of Huntington Beach Senior Deputy City Attorney

I. MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS REVIEW

- Written Proposal Score: 64.5%

VENDOR No. 2 – Minimum Qualifications Review		
<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Total Weighted Score</u>	<u>Maximum Score</u>
<i>Compliance with RFP</i>	75	100
<i>Understanding of the Project</i>	450	500
<i>Recent Experience</i>	350	500
<i>Clarity</i>	160	200
<i>Price</i>	125	500
<i>References</i>	130	200
Total	1290	2000

II. DUE DILIGENCE REVIEW

- Interview Ranking: 1 (tied for 1st with vendor #1)

Vendor No. 2 – Summary of Review
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Submitted RFP did not include an annual fee schedule• Did not include 180 day proposal price guarantee statement• Excellent methodology and process

Vendor No. 2 – Pricing
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Supplemental information after proposal submittal included price, which was higher than vendor #1

PROFESSIONAL SERVICE AWARD ANALYSIS

SERVICE: General Liability Claim Third Party Administrator

SERVICE DESCRIPTION: Provide General Liability Claim Administration.

VENDOR: Vendor #3

OVERALL RANKING: 3

SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS/RATERS: 1. City of H.B. Risk Manager 2. City of H.B. Senior Risk Management Analyst 3. City of Huntington Beach Risk Management Specialist 4. City of Huntington Beach Senior Deputy City Attorney

I. MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS REVIEW

- Written Proposal Score: 67%

VENDOR No. 2 – Minimum Qualifications Review		
<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Total Weighted Score</u>	<u>Maximum Score</u>
<i>Compliance with RFP</i>	85	100
<i>Understanding of the Project</i>	425	500
<i>Recent Experience</i>	350	500
<i>Clarity</i>	150	200
<i>Price</i>	150	500
<i>References</i>	180	200
Total	1340	2000

II. DUE DILIGENCE REVIEW

- Interview Ranking: 3 (vendor 1 and vendor 2 were tied for 1st place ranking)

Vendor No. 3 – Summary of Review
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Directly and clearly addressed RFP requirements• Included examples of methodology with clients, including results of those practices• Excellent methodology and process

Vendor No. 3 – Pricing
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Their price was the highest of all submitted proposals, almost double the budgeted amount