



MINUTES

HUNTINGTON BEACH PLANNING COMMISSION

TUESDAY, JULY 27, 2021

HUNTINGTON BEACH CIVIC CENTER

2000 MAIN STREET, HUNTINGTON BEACH, CALIFORNIA 92648

6:00 P.M. – COUNCIL CHAMBERS

CALL PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING TO ORDER

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE – Led by Commissioner Rodriguez

P P P P P P

ROLL CALL: *Rodriguez, Acosta-Galvan, Perkins, Ray, Mandic, Scandura*

PUBLIC COMMENTS - None

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

21-543 APPEAL OF THE ZONING ADMINISTRATOR'S APPROVAL OF ENTITLEMENT PLAN AMENDMENT NO. 21-002 (CHEVRON CONVENIENCE MARKET) (CONTINUED FROM THE JULY 13, 2021 MEETING AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST)

REQUEST:

To amend Conditional Use Permit No. 15-055 to allow the sale of distilled spirits for off-site consumption (ABC License Type 21) in conjunction with a 1,630 sq. ft. convenience market.

LOCATION:

16921 Algonquin Street, 92649 (northwest corner of Algonquin Street and Davenport Drive)

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

That the Planning Commission take the following actions:

- A) Find the proposed project categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15301, Class 1 - Existing Facilities, and
- B) Approve Entitlement Plan Amendment No. 21-002 with findings and conditions of approval (Attachment No. 1).

The Commission made the following disclosures:

- Commissioner Scandura recused himself, due to his wife's workplace being within 500 feet of the subject site, and left the room.

- Commissioner Rodriguez had no disclosures.
- Commissioner Acosta-Galvan had no disclosures.
- Vice-Chair Perkins visited the site.
- Chair Ray visited the site.
- Commissioner Mandic visited the site and spoke with residents and staff.

Tess Nguyen, Associate Planner, gave the staff presentation for the proposed project.

There was discussion on the following items: the fire access lanes, the number of gas stations in the city that sell hard liquor, Alcoholic Beverage Control (ABC) noticing and signage requirements, and prohibiting exterior advertisement of alcohol sales.

THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS OPENED.

Sherrie Olson, applicant, spoke in support of Item No. 21-543. She reviewed the overall history of the business, the lack of Police calls for service since the business began selling beer and wine alcohol license, the community outreach the applicant provided, and noted that adjacent businesses, such as Trader Joes, sell hard liquor.

Ross de la Haye, resident, spoke in opposition to item no. 21-543, citing concerns regarding potential negative safety impacts to the neighborhood.

Tarrik Shawa, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing concerns with potential negative safety impacts.

Bruce Rieser, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing concerns with potential negative impacts to the adjacent neighborhood.

Wilson Turner, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing concerns with potential negative safety impacts to the adjacent neighborhood.

Larry Weisenthal, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing concerns with negative impacts to the adjacent residents.

Bruce McDonald, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing the plethora of liquor licenses in the area.

Dave Sullivan, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing concerns with the proximity to the school.

Suzanne Tamaru, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing concerns with the potential negative impacts to the neighborhood and adjacent elementary school.

Chris Bures, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 21-543, citing concerns with the potential negative impacts to the community.

WITH NO ONE ELSE PRESENT TO SPEAK, THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS CLOSED.

There was discussion regarding the noticing required by ABC, the location, the proximity to residents, and the potential for negative impacts.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY MANDIC, SECONDED BY RODRIGUEZ, TO DENY ENTITLEMENT PLAN AMENDMENT NO. 21-002 WITH FINDINGS FOR DENIAL, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Rodriguez, Acosta-Galvan, Perkins, Ray, Mandic
NOES: None
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: Scandura

MOTION APPROVED

FINDINGS FOR DENIAL – ENTITLEMENT PLAN AMENDMENT NO. 21-002:

Entitlement Plan Amendment No. 21-002 to amend Conditional Use Permit No. 15-055 to allow the sale of beer, wine, and distilled spirits for off-sale consumption (ABC License Type 21) in conjunction with a 1,630 sq. ft. convenience market will be detrimental to the general welfare of persons working or residing in the vicinity or detrimental to the value of the property and improvements in the neighborhood because the use is incompatible with the area and does not meet the needs of local residents. The proposed use will create adverse impacts to the surrounding residents based on the proposed type of alcohol sales.

Commissioner Scandura returned to the room.

21-495 CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 20-015 (G&M OIL SERVICE STATION)

REQUEST:

To permit the construction of a new gasoline fueling service station with a 22,309 sq. ft. lot size instead of the minimum 22,500 sq. ft. lot size; the development includes four fueling pump stations, a 2,314 sq. ft. canopy, underground fuel storage tanks, a 2,182 sq. ft. retail store building with beer and wine sales (ABC Type 20 License), a 24-hour operation, and ancillary site improvements including paving, on-site parking, landscaping, and signage.

LOCATION:

14972 Springdale Street, 92647 (Northeast corner of Springdale Street at Bolsa Avenue)

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

That the Planning Commission take the following actions:

- A) Find the proposed project categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15303, Class 3 - New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures; and
- B) Approve Conditional Use Permit No. 20-015 with suggested findings and conditions of approval (Attachment No. 1).

The Commission made the following disclosures:

- Commissioner Rodriguez had no disclosures.
- Commissioner Acosta-Galvan had no disclosures.
- Vice-Chair Perkins visited the site.
- Chair Ray visited the site.
- Commissioner Scandura visited the site, spoke with staff and the applicant, and voted on similar items in the past.
- Commissioner Mandic visited the site.

Hayden Beckman, Senior Planner, gave the staff presentation for the proposed project.

There was discussion on the following items: parking modifications, median lot size for gas stations, traffic and queueing concerns, accessibility, environmental impact concerns, previous remediation on the site, proposed fire access, and the proposed landscaping.

THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS OPENED.

Karl Huy, applicant, spoke in support of Item No. 20-015, noting that he is in agreement with staff's recommended conditions of approval, that remediation on the site has been completed, and that the property owner is looking to donate the potted trees currently located onsite.

WITH NO ONE ELSE PRESENT TO SPEAK, THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS CLOSED.

There was discussion on amending suggested condition No. 1(a) and the suitability of this use on the property.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY SCANDURA, SECONDED BY MANDIC, TO FIND THE PROPOSED PROJECT CATEGORICALLY EXEMPT FROM THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA) PURSUANT TO SECTION 15303, CLASS 3, AND APPROVE CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 20-015 WITH SUGGESTED FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS TO CONDITION 1(A), BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Rodriguez, Perkins, Ray, Mandic, Scandura,
NOES: Acosta-Galvan
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

MOTION APPROVED

FINDINGS FOR PROJECTS EXEMPT FROM CEQA:

The Planning Commission finds that the project will not have any significant effect on the environment and is Categorically Exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15303, Class 3 – *New Construction of Conversion of Small Structures*, because the project involves the construction of one commercial building that

is less than 10,000 sq. ft. where all necessary public services and facilities are available and the surrounding area is not environmentally sensitive.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL - CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 20-015:

1. Conditional Use Permit No. 20-015 to permit the construction of a new gasoline fueling service station with a 22,309 sq. ft. lot size instead of the minimum 22,500 sq. ft. lot size; including four fueling pump stations, a 2,314 sq. ft. canopy, underground fuel storage tanks, a 2,182 sq. ft. retail store building with beer and wine sales (ABC Type 20 License), a 24-hour operation, and ancillary site improvements will not be detrimental to the general welfare of persons working or residing in the vicinity or detrimental to the value of the property and improvements in the neighborhood because the proposed use is located within an existing commercial area with other similar uses. The sale of alcohol provides an additional convenient service to the community and surrounding regional area. The convenience store and fueling station is not anticipated to generate significant noise, traffic, or other impacts that would be detrimental to the surrounding area residents and businesses. The Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance (HBZSO) and General Plan land use designation anticipated fueling service station uses, including retail markets with beer and wine sales in this area. The request for beer and wine sales will provide an additional convenience for patrons and will not generate detrimental impacts to surrounding properties, as beer and wine will be sold for off-site consumption only.
2. Conditional Use Permit No. 20-015 to permit the construction of a new gasoline fueling service station with a 22,309 sq. ft. lot size instead of the minimum 22,500 sq. ft. lot size; including four fueling pump stations, a 2,314 sq. ft. canopy, underground fuel storage tanks, a 2,182 sq. ft. retail store building with beer and wine sales (ABC Type 20 License), a 24-hour operation, and ancillary site improvements will comply with applicable provisions in Titles 20-25 of the HBZSO because the HBZSO allows for the development of substandard lots, and operation of fueling stations and convenience markets with alcohol sales subject to approval of a conditional use permit. The General Plan land use designation and the HBZSO anticipated convenience stores and fueling stations with alcohol sales in this area. The request for beer and wine sales will serve to augment the overall customer experience by providing an additional convenience for patrons.
3. The General Plan Land Use Map designation on the subject property is currently CN (Commercial Neighborhood). The request to permit the construction of a new gasoline fueling service station with a 22,309 sq. ft. lot size instead of the minimum 22,500 sq. ft. lot size; including four fueling pump stations, a 2,314 sq. ft. canopy, underground fuel storage tanks, a 2,182 sq. ft. retail store building with beer and wine sales (ABC Type 20 License), a 24-hour operation, and ancillary site improvements is consistent with this designation and the goals, policies, and objectives of the City's General Plan as follows:

Land Use Element

Goal LU-1: New commercial, industrial, and residential development is coordinated to ensure that the land use pattern is consistent with the overall goals and needs of the community.

Policy LU-1(D): Ensure that new development projects are of compatible proportion, scale, and character to complement adjoining uses.

Goal LU-11: Commercial land uses provide goods and services to meet regional and local needs.

Policy LU-11 (B): Encourage new businesses to locate on existing vacant or underutilized commercial properties where these properties have good locations and accessibility.

Policy LU-12(B): Encourage renovation and revitalization of deteriorating and struggling nonresidential areas and corridors, particularly commercial locations.

The proposed construction of service station with a convenience market is designed and coordinated with the surrounding streetscape to ensure the land use pattern is consistent with the goals and needs of the community. The project removes excessive driveways onto the site, and incorporates reciprocal access between the subject site and the commercial property to the north, resulting in a safe circulation pattern that improves upon the existing circulation and access pattern. The proposed single-story development project is compatible in proportion, scale, and character of the adjoining uses. The development complies with all applicable development standards for service stations, and includes excess perimeter landscaping that buffers the street edge and adjacent commercial uses. The proposed architectural elements such as the pronounced corner tower facades, awnings, and stone veneer is compatible with and enhances the character of the adjoining uses. Furthermore, the new service station and convenience market with beer and wine sales offers a service that meets the regional and local community needs on an underutilized commercial property with an optimal location and accessibility located at the intersection of a primary (Springdale Street) and major (Bolsa Avenue) arterial highway.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL - CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 20-015:

1. The site plan, floor plan, and elevations received and dated June 16, 2021 and the exterior radius exhibit received and dated July 26, 2021 shall be the conceptually approved layout.
2. The use shall comply with the following:
 - a. All deliveries to the property, including fuel and retail products, shall be limited to the hours of 8:00 AM – 6:00 PM.
 - b. Fuel trucks and delivery trucks shall not idle for any length of time.
 - c. Employees shall not remove trash and dispose of it outside the building between 10:00 PM and 8:00 AM.
 - d. There shall be no exterior advertising or sign of any kind or type, including advertising directed to the exterior from within, promoting or indicating the availability of alcoholic beverages.
 - e. Prior to the sales of alcoholic beverages, the business shall obtain a California Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control (ABC) license authorizing off sale alcohol sales. The ABC license shall be limited to "Off-sale" Type 20 – Beer and Wine Off-sale. All conditions contained in the ABC license shall be adhered to. **(PD)**
 - f. Hours of alcohol sales shall be limited to between 6:00 AM and 2:00 AM. **(PD)**

- g. Refrigerators and cabinets where alcohol is located must be locked to customers between 2:00 AM to 6:00 AM. **(PD)**
 - h. All persons engaged in the sale of alcohol shall complete a mandatory Responsible Beverage Service (RBS) training and certification. This shall be required for new employees within 90 days of being hired and for existing employees every 12 months. Training shall be provided by an ABC approved RBS trainer and records of the training must be maintained on-site for review. **(PD)**
 - i. The facility shall employ a video surveillance security system and a minimum of one-month video library. The minimum requirements for the cameras will be: Clear, color, digital recording to DVR or cloud based type system and able to record in low light. Electronic copies of video must be made available to the Huntington Beach Police Department within 48 hours of request. Digital recordings shall be made available for viewing on-scene upon request by police personnel conducting investigations. You are required to have someone able to operate the system on duty during all business hours. **(PD)**
 - j. Live entertainment is prohibited. **(PD)**
 - k. In an effort to reduce the likelihood of alcohol related crimes, the display or sale of the following items shall be prohibited **(PD)**:
 - Wine containers of less than 750 milliliters.
 - Wine with alcoholic content greater than 14 percent by volume unless corked bottles and aged at least two years.
 - Beer or malt liquor products sold individually in containers of less than 24 ounces, except for small production craft-type beer only available in 24 ounces or less containers.
 - Containers of beer or malt liquor not in their original factory packages of six-packs or greater.
 - Cooler products, either wine or malt liquor beverage based, in less than three-pack quantities.
3. Signage shall be reviewed under separate permits and applicable processing.
 4. At least 14 days prior to any grading activity, the property owner/developer shall provide notice in writing to property owners of record and tenants of properties within a 500-foot radius of the project site as noticed for the public hearing. The notice shall include a general description of planned grading activities and an estimated timeline for commencement and completion of work and a contact person name with phone number. Prior to issuance of the grading permit, a copy of the notice and list of recipients shall be submitted to the Community Development Department.
 5. Prior to issuance of a grading permit, the following shall be completed:
 - a. A 30-foot easement dedication for street purposes and public utilities along the Springdale Street frontage to provide a 50 foot public right-of-way width from street centerline to property line. **(PW)**

- b. A 40-foot easement dedication for street purposes and public utilities along the Bolsa Avenue frontage to provide a 60 foot public right-of-way width from street centerline to property line. **(PW)**
 - c. An interim parking and building materials storage plan shall be submitted to the Planning Division to assure adequate parking and restroom facilities are available for employees, customers and contractors during the project's construction phase and that adjacent properties will not be impacted by their location. The plan shall also be reviewed and approved by the Fire Department and Public Works Department. The property owner/developer shall obtain any necessary encroachment permits from the Department of Public Works.
6. During demolition, grading, site development, and/or construction, the following shall be adhered to: All Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance and Municipal Code requirements including the Noise Ordinance. All activities including truck deliveries associated with construction, grading, remodeling, or repair shall be limited to Monday - Saturday 7:00 AM to 8:00 PM. Such activities are prohibited Sundays and Federal holidays. **(HBMC 8.40.090)**
 7. Conditional Use Permit No. 20-015 shall become null and void unless exercised within two (2) years of the date of final approval or such extension of time as may be granted by the Director pursuant to a written request submitted to the Community Development Department a minimum 30 days prior to the expiration date.
 8. Conditional Use Permit No. 20-015 shall not become effective until the appeal period following the approval of the entitlement has elapsed.
 9. The Planning Commission reserves the right to revoke Conditional Use Permit No. 20-015 pursuant to a public hearing for revocation, if any violation of the conditions of approval, Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance, or Municipal Code occurs.
 10. The applicant and/or applicant's representative shall be responsible for ensuring the accuracy of all plans and information submitted to the City for review and approval.
 11. The Development Services Departments (Community Development, Fire, and Public Works) shall be responsible for ensuring compliance with all applicable code requirements and conditions of approval. The Director of Community Development may approve minor amendments to plans and/or conditions of approval as appropriate based on changed circumstances, new information or other relevant factors. Any proposed plan/project revisions shall be called out on the plan sets submitted for building permits. Permits shall not be issued until the Development Services Departments have reviewed and approved the proposed changes for conformance with the intent of the Planning Commission's action. If the proposed changes are of a substantial nature, an amendment to the original entitlement reviewed by the Planning Commission may be required pursuant to the provisions of HBZSO Section 241.18.

INDEMNIFICATION AND HOLD HARMLESS CONDITION:

The owner of the property which is the subject of this project and the project applicant if different from the property owner, and each of their heirs, successors and assigns, shall defend,

indemnify and hold harmless the City of Huntington Beach and its agents, officers, and employees from any claim, action or proceedings, liability cost, including attorney's fees and costs against the City or its agents, officers or employees, to attack, set aside, void or annul any approval of the City, including but not limited to any approval granted by the City Council, Planning Commission, or Design Review Board concerning this project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any claim, action or proceeding and should cooperate fully in the defense thereof.

CONSENT CALENDAR - NONE

NON-PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS - NONE

PLANNING ITEMS

Jane James, Planning Manager, reported on recent and upcoming City Council meetings, and on items scheduled for upcoming Planning Commission meetings.

PLANNING COMMISSION ITEMS

Commissioner Scandura congratulated Rhonda Bolton on her appointment to the City Council and reported on the recent Historic Resources Board meeting.

ADJOURNMENT: Adjourned at 7:21 PM to the next regularly scheduled meeting of Tuesday, August 10, 2021.

APPROVED BY:



Jennifer Villaseñor, Acting Secretary



Alan Ray, Chairperson