



MINUTES

HUNTINGTON BEACH PLANNING COMMISSION

TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 24, 2024
HUNTINGTON BEACH CIVIC CENTER
2000 MAIN STREET, HUNTINGTON BEACH, CALIFORNIA 92648

6:00 P.M. – COUNCIL CHAMBERS

CALL PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING TO ORDER

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE – Led by Commissioner Adam

P P P P P P P
ROLL CALL: *Adam, Pellman, Kennedy, Twining, Wood, Rodriguez, Acosta-Galvan*

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Robert Granger, resident, spoke regarding the proposed Huntington Beach City School District Maintenance Yard project, the permitting process, the current negative noise impacts, the CEQA process, and the potential negative impacts to the adjacent residences.

Mark Currie, resident, spoke regarding the proposed Huntington Beach City School District Maintenance Yard project, citing concerns with the potential noise, traffic, and other associated impacts. Mr. Currie asked the Planning Commission to bring the item back for another public hearing.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY KENNEDY, SECONDED BY PELLMAN, TO RE-OPEN THE PUBLIC HEARING FOR ITEM NO. 24-665, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Pellman, Kennedy, Twining, Rodriguez, Acosta-Galvan
NOES: Adam, Wood
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

MOTION PASSED

THE MINUTES WILL REFLECT ITEMS IN THEIR ORIGINAL ORDER.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

24-665 REVISED ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT NO. 21-004, GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT NO. 21-004, ZONING MAP AMENDMENT NO. 21-003, ZONING TEXT AMENDMENT NO. 22-005, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 21-024 (BOLSA CHICA SENIOR CARE COMMUNITY) - CONTINUED FROM THE SEPTEMBER 10, 2024 MEETING WITH THE PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED.

REQUEST:

REVISED EIR: To analyze the potential environmental impacts associated with the revised project; **GPA:** Revise the General Plan Land Use Map designation from Commercial General (CG) to Mixed Use (MU) with a Specific Plan Overlay; **ZMA:** To amend the zoning designation from Commercial General (CG) to Specific Plan 19 (SP-19); **ZTA:** To establish the Bolsa Chica Senior Care Community Specific Plan including development standards for height, open space, and convalescent uses on the subject site; **CUP:** To demolish 50,000 sq. ft. of existing commercial space and construct a new four-story 215,000 sq. ft. convalescent facility with on-site alcohol sales and consumption at a maximum overall height of 49.5 ft., consisting of 159 total units, a subterranean parking garage, and associated hardscape and landscape improvements on a property with a grade differential above three feet.

LOCATION:

4952 & 4972 Warner Avenue, 92649 (Southwest corner of Bolsa Chica Street and Warner Avenue)

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

The Planning Commission has discretionary purview only over the Conditional Use Permit portion of the project request. The City Council has discretionary purview over the revised EIR, General Plan Amendment, Zoning Map Amendment, and Zoning Text Amendment. Therefore, the Planning Commission may take the following actions:

- A. Recommend certification of Environmental Impact Report No. 21-004 as adequate and complete in accordance with CEQA requirements by approving draft City Council Resolution No. 24-XX and forward to the City Council for adoption (Attachment No. 2); and

Recommend approval of General Plan Amendment No. 21-004 by approving draft City Council Resolution No. 24-XX (Attachment No. 3), Zoning Map Amendment No. 21-003 with findings (Attachment No. 1) by approving draft City Council Ordinance No. XXXX (Attachment No. 4), and Zoning Text Amendment No. 22-005 with findings (Attachment No. 1) by approving draft City Council Resolution No. 24-XX (Attachment No. 5); and

Approve Conditional Use Permit No. 21-024 with findings and conditions of approval (Attachment No. 1).

- B. Deny General Plan Amendment No. 21-004/Zoning Map Amendment No. 21-003/Zoning Text Amendment No. 22-005/Conditional Use Permit No. 21-024/Environmental Impact Report No. 21-004.
- C. Continue Environmental Impact Report No. 21-004, General Plan Amendment No. 21-004, Zoning Map Amendment No. 21-003, Zoning Text Amendment No. 22-005, and Conditional Use Permit No. 21-024 and direct staff accordingly.

The Commission made the following disclosures:

- Commissioner Adam spoke with staff.
- Commissioner Pellman spoke with staff, the developer, and residents.
- Vice-Chair Kennedy had no disclosures.

- Chair Twining spoke with staff.
- Commissioner Wood spoke with staff and the developer.
- Commissioner Rodriguez spoke with the developer
- Commissioner Acosta-Galvan spoke with staff, the developer, and watched the September 10, 2024, Planning Commission meeting.

THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS RE-OPENED.

Jonathan Bonwit, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the potential negative parking impacts.

Henry Goode, resident, spoke in support of Item No. 24-665, and stated that the opposition petition being circulated in the surrounding area includes misinformation about the proposed project.

David Goodwin, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with building height, traffic impacts, the proposed density, and potential neighborhood incompatibility.

Mark Tonovich, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the proposed height and the neighborhood incompatibility.

Wes Stoner, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the proposed size, scale, scope, and potential neighborhood incompatibility of the proposed project.

Jennifer Dymicki, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing the potential parking and traffic impacts and the prohibitive cost of residing in the proposed facility.

Ann Palmer, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the proposed height, the proposed setbacks, and the potential negative infrastructure and utility impacts.

Amory Hanson, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing building size and potential environmental impacts.

Christine Padesky, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the accuracy of the Environmental Impact Report, the accuracy of the applicant provided shadow study, and the potential for the facility to be converted to condominiums.

Kathleen Mooney, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the proposed building size, the potential negative aesthetic impacts, and asked the Planning Commission to adhere to the current zoning code.

Tom Dillman, resident and homeowners association member from Cabo del Mar, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing the distance from the proposed facility to local hospitals and medical centers. He also expressed concerns with the proposed building height.

Brian Thienes, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns

that the project does not adhere to the two state senate bills cited by the applicant, and the incompatibility with the neighborhood.

James Filipan, resident and the subject property owner, spoke in support of Item No. 24-665, citing the changing business environment and the age of the current building. He stated that he would help the current tenants relocate and that the traffic created by the proposed use would be less than the current use.

Cheryle Browning, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the proposed setbacks, building massing, potential aesthetic impacts, and the potential negative impacts to infrastructure.

Perry Clitheroe, resident, spoke in support of Item No. 24-665, citing the rising housing costs, the city's budget deficit, and the benefits to the city and residents.

Dan Grommersch, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the change of zoning being requested and the density of the proposed project.

Marcie Zeller, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with potential negative parking and aesthetic impacts.

Debra Cohen, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, asking that the proposed project comply with the current zoning code and not require a new specific plan.

Tom Lawless, applicant, spoke in support of Item No. 24-665. He expressed concern with inaccuracies in Mr. Thienes's objection letter and the petition presented to the commission. He stated that proposed parking supply will be greater than the daily demand.

Jimmy Murray, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing concerns with the proposed parking. He indicated that he would support a project that minimizes negative impacts on the surrounding community.

John Carrington, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing the potential negative impacts of the shadowing on his lawn. He also expressed concern with the potential parking, traffic, construction, and noise impacts.

Becky L, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, and asked that it be revised to meet the current zoning code. She questioned the proposed unit sizes and the need for the facility.

Michelle Ryan, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing the size of the proposed project and potential neighborhood incompatibility.

Emma Clay, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-665, citing potential negative parking, construction, and environmental impacts.

WITH NO ONE ELSE PRESENT TO SPEAK, THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS CLOSED.

There was lengthy discussion regarding the density of the proposed project, how

density is measured or not measured for a commercial project, the proposed parking, the accuracy of the petition signed by residents, similar uses throughout the city, the building height allowed in the current zoning, the reduced project proposal, the potential traffic impacts, the use of specific plans throughout the city, the need for senior housing in the city, and the development impact fees.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY KENNEDY TO FORCE RODRIGUEZ TO RECUSE HIMSELF DUE TO AN UPCOMING MOVE OUT OF THE CITY.

MOTION DECLARED INVALID BY SENIOR DEPUTY CITY ATTORNEY HYLAND AND THE MOTION WAS WITHDRAWN.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY TWINING, SECONDED BY RODRIGUEZ, TO RECOMMEND CERTIFICATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT NO. 21-004 AS ADEQUATE AND COMPLETE IN ACCORDANCE WITH CEQA REQUIREMENTS BY APPROVING DRAFT CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION NO. 24-XX AND FORWARD TO THE CITY COUNCIL FOR ADOPTION; AND; RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT NO. 21-004 BY APPROVING DRAFT CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION NO. 24-XX, ZONING MAP AMENDMENT NO. 21-003 WITH FINDINGS BY APPROVING DRAFT CITY COUNCIL ORDINANCE NO. XXXX, AND ZONING TEXT AMENDMENT NO. 22-005 WITH FINDINGS BY APPROVING DRAFT CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION NO. 24-XX; AND APPROVE CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 21-024 WITH FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

**AYES: Adam, Wood, Rodriguez, Acosta-Galvan
NOES: Pellman, Kennedy, Twining
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None**

MOTION PASSED

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL - ZONING MAP AMENDMENT NO. 22-003:

1. Zoning Map Amendment (ZMA) No. 22-003 to amend the zoning designation of the ±3 acre site from Commercial General (CG) to Specific Plan 19 (Bolsa Chica Senior Care Community Specific Plan) is consistent with the goals, objectives, policies, general land uses and programs specified in the General Plan as follows:

A. Land Use Element

Goal LU-1 – New commercial, industrial, and residential development is coordinated to ensure that the land use pattern is consistent with the overall goals and needs of the community.

Policy LU-1A - Ensure that development is consistent with the land use designations presented in the Land Use Map, including density, intensity, and use standards applicable to each land use designation.

Goal LU-12B – Encourage renovation and revitalization of deteriorating and struggling nonresidential areas and corridors, particularly commercial locations.

The Specific Plan designation will be consistent with the approved General Plan land use designations in that its implementation will assist in meeting the overall housing needs of the community and will be compatible in proportion, scale, and character of the surrounding land uses as the proposed project will replace two underutilized commercial properties and will be similar in massing to other multi-story senior living facilities in the City. It will enhance the local economy, provide additional revenue to the City, create jobs, and provide additional attainable senior housing stock.

B. Housing Element

Goal H1 – Maintain and enhance the quality and affordability of existing housing in Huntington Beach.

Policy H1.1 – Preserve the character, scale, and quality of established residential neighborhoods.

Policy 2.1 – Provide site opportunities for development of housing that responds to diverse community needs in terms of housing types, cost and location, emphasizing locations near services and transit that promote walkability.

Policy 2.2 – Facilitate the efficient use of land by allowing and encouraging commercial and residential uses on the same property in both horizontal and vertical mixed-use configurations.

The proposed project is quasi-residential and designed to reflect a traditional style of architecture that is reflective of the City's beach lifestyle and complements and enhances the surrounding areas. The project includes high quality design, architecture, and materials that is consistent with the overall character of the surrounding neighborhoods. Additionally, multiple nearby commercial businesses are within walking distance of the project site, and for those services that aren't, van services would be provided to residents to access additional adjacent commercial uses including restaurants, medical offices, and pharmacies.

2. ZMA No. 22-003 to change the zoning of the subject site to Specific Plan is compatible with the zoning in the surrounding area because the Specific Plan will establish development standards that are largely consistent with the approved General Plan designation of Commercial General. The subject site is located at a high volume traffic intersection that features commercial zoning on each of the corners, and a mix of commercial and residential zoning districts in adjacent areas. Since the proposed land use under the Specific Plan is quasi-residential, and will be less intense of a use than the existing commercial developments, the project will be compatible with the well-established mix of residential and commercial uses along both Warner Avenue and Bolsa Chica Street corridors. The project will place 98% of employee, resident, and visitor parking in a subterranean garage and will provide building setbacks in excess of those required by the existing base zoning district. Architectural design incorporates varied rooflines, offset building massing, upper story setbacks, and a mix of high quality building materials and landscaping treatments to blend into the surrounding environment. Site planning design incorporates outdoor amenity areas and fire access lanes between the proposed building facades and the adjacent residential and commercial properties to the west and south, respectively. The north and east frontages are buffered by Warner Avenue and Bolsa Chica Street, respectively from adjacent uses. These buffer distances, as well as a new 8 foot high masonry wall along the southern property line works are proposed to mitigate noise from operation of the senior living community.

3. A community need is demonstrated for the change proposed because the Specific Plan designation will allow the development of a new senior convalescent care facility at the subject site tailored to serve the growing demand for housing options for residents aged 55 and older. Data from the 2020 census indicates that 25% of the City's population is 60 years of age or older, and as the local population ages, the proposed Specific Plan will allow the development of additional senior units in a modern facility with high quality design, architecture, and amenities for residents and their visitors. Further, the Specific Plan will enhance the local economy, provide additional revenue to the City, create jobs, and provide additional senior housing stock.
4. Its adoption will be in conformity with public convenience, general welfare and good zoning practice because the Specific Plan designation will implement the proposed Mixed Use General Plan land use designations, and is compatible with the zoning in the surrounding area, and It will allow the development of a modern senior living community of high quality design to serve the expanding population of aging residents and their visitors. It will enhance the local economy, provide additional revenue to the City, create jobs, and provide additional senior housing stock.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL - ZONING TEXT AMENDMENT NO. 22-005:

1. Zoning Text Amendment No. 22-005 to establish the Bolsa Chica Senior Care Community Specific Plan (BCSCCSP) includes development standards for height, open space, and convalescent uses on the subject site. ZTA No. 22-005 is consistent with and implements the adopted land use element of the General Plan which include a Specific Plan Overlay for the subject site. ZTA No. 22-005 is consistent with applicable General Plan goals, objectives, and policies and is compatible with surrounding developments as follows:

A. Land Use Element

Goal LU-1 – New commercial, industrial, and residential development is coordinated to ensure that the land use pattern is consistent with the overall goals and needs of the community.

Policy LU-1C: Support infill development, consolidation of parcels, and adaptive reuse of existing buildings.

Policy LU-1D: Ensure that new development projects are of compatible proportion, scale, and character to complement adjoining uses.

Policy LU-2E: Intensify the use and strengthen the role of public art, architecture, landscaping, site design, and development patterns to enhance the visual image of Huntington Beach.

Goal LU-4 - A range of housing types is available to meet the diverse economic, physical, and social needs of future and existing residents, while neighborhood character and residences are well maintained and protected.

Policy LU-4A - Encourage a mix of residential types to accommodate people with diverse housing needs.

Goal LU-11B - Encourage new businesses to locate on existing vacant or underutilized commercial properties where these properties have good locations and accessibility.

Goal LU-12B - Encourage renovation and revitalization of deteriorating and struggling nonresidential areas and corridors, particularly commercial locations.

ZTA No. 22-005 provides for an infill redevelopment project on an underutilized commercial site that would assist in meeting the overall housing needs of the community. The proposed convalescent facility is compatible in proportion, scale, and character of the surrounding land uses because the proposed building is similar in height and massing to other multi-story senior living facilities adjacent to residential uses and incorporates high quality architectural design. It will enhance the local economy, create jobs, and provide additional senior housing stock.

B. Noise Element

Goal N-1: Noise-sensitive land uses are protected in areas with acceptable noise levels.

Policy N-1B: Incorporate design and construction features into residential, mixed-use, commercial, and industrial projects that shield noise-sensitive land uses from excessive noise.

Goal N-2: Land use patterns are compatible with current and future noise levels.

Goal N-3B: Prioritize use of site planning and project design techniques to mitigate excessive noise. The use of noise barriers shall be considered a means of achieving the noise standards only after all other practical design-related noise mitigation measures have been integrated into the project.

The proposed project would introduce a quasi-residential land use on a property currently developed with commercial office and retail uses. The proposed project's design incorporates the existing configuration of the project site to maintain acceptable stationary noise levels at existing noise-sensitive land uses by placing outdoor amenities and vehicle parking associated with the use behind or beneath the primary structure so as to attenuate potential off-site noise impacts. Additionally, a new 8-foot high masonry wall would be installed along the project site's southern boundary and operational noise levels would not exceed the City's exterior daytime or nighttime noise standards as established in the Municipal Code. Further, the use of modern construction methods and materials will reduce vehicle noise from the adjacent roadways, and the building design and siting is proposed to enclose the future residents' common open space courtyards to minimize any roadway noise from Warner Avenue and Bolsa Chica Street.

C. Housing Element

Goal H2 - Provide adequate housing sites through appropriate land use, zoning, and specific plan designations to accommodate Huntington Beach's share of regional housing needs.

Policy H2.1 – Provide site opportunities for development of housing that response to diverse community needs in terms of housing types, cost, and location emphasizing locations near services and transit that promote walkability.

ZTA No. 22-005 would also allow a senior care community that is designed to provide a variety of senior unit types to suit different life stages and market segments. In order to create a senior care community that includes high quality design, architecture, and materials that are consistent with the overall character of the surrounding neighborhood, the applicant is proposing development standards that would allow assisted and memory care units that provide a continuum of care within the same building. A more dense senior care community project enables a modern facility of high quality amenities and services that ensure that residents are provided quality and dependable services and connection to the surrounding community without negatively impacting surrounding uses.

2. ZTA No. 22-005 will enhance the potential for superior urban design in comparison with the development under the base district provisions that would apply if the plan were not approved because it will facilitate a modern facility of high quality amenities and services that ensure that residents are provided quality and dependable services and connection to the surrounding community without negatively impacting surrounding uses. The BCSCCSP will allow senior living unit types to suit different life stages and market segments.
3. Deviations from the base district provisions that otherwise would apply are justified by compensating benefits of the BCSCCSP because it will facilitate the provision of senior housing to suit different life stages and market segments consistent with current demand in a single cohesive structure on an underutilized commercial property. A more compact convalescent facility enables the proposed senior care density while providing greater setbacks, landscaping, and adequate public safety access infrastructure.
4. The specific plan includes adequate provisions for utilities, services, and emergency vehicle access. Public service demands will not exceed the capacity of existing and planned systems.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL – CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 21-024:

1. Conditional Use Permit No. 21-024 to demolish 50,000 sq. ft. of existing commercial space and construct a new four-story 215,000 sq. ft. convalescent facility with on-site alcohol sales and consumption at a maximum overall height of 49.5 ft., consisting of 159 total units, a subterranean parking garage, and associated hardscape and landscape improvements on a property with a grade differential above three feet that involves the excavation of more than 25,000 cubic yards of soil will not be detrimental to the general welfare of persons working or residing in the vicinity or detrimental to the value of the property and improvements in the neighborhood because the new four-story senior care community project is an infill development on two underutilized commercial properties that would assist in meeting the overall housing needs of the community. In addition, the proposed convalescent facility is compatible in proportion, scale, and character of the surrounding land uses because the proposed building is similar in height and massing to other multi-story senior living facilities in the City that are adjacent to residential uses and incorporates high quality architectural design. The project designed reflects a traditional style of architecture that is reflective of the City's beach lifestyle that complements and enhances the architectural style of the larger surrounding area. A variety of building materials, multilevel rooflines, and varying building setbacks along the Warner and Bolsa Chica frontages are incorporated into the proposed design and are intended to break up the scale and massing of the building. Landscaping includes a variety of tree and plant species and is designed to complement the architecture, frame the building elements, and be consistent with the overall character of the surrounding area. Project implementation would involve approximately 55,000 cubic yards of cut that would be exported offsite, a majority of which is excavation to accommodate the subterranean parking garage. The remaining portions of the site will be more precisely leveled to provide a single level building surface. Lastly, the proposed convalescent facility supports the provision of a mix of housing types that meet the diverse economic, social, and housing needs of the community.
2. The granting of the conditional use permit to demolish 50,000 sq. ft. of existing commercial space and construct a new four-story 215,000 sq. ft. convalescent facility with on-site alcohol sales and consumption at a maximum overall height of 49.5 ft., consisting of 159 total units, a subterranean parking garage, and associated hardscape and landscape improvements on a property with a grade differential above three feet that involves the excavation of more than

25,000 cubic yards of soil will not adversely affect the General Plan because it is consistent with the Land Use Element designation of MU (Mixed Use) on the subject property. In addition, it is consistent with the following goals and policies of the General Plan:

Land Use Element

Goal LU-1: New commercial, industrial, and residential development is coordinated to ensure the land use pattern is consistent with the overall goals and needs of the community.

Policy LU-1C: Support infill development, consolidation of parcels, and adaptive reuse of existing buildings.

Policy LU-1D: Ensure that new development projects are of compatible proportion, scale, and character to complement adjoining uses.

Policy LU-2E: Intensify the use and strengthen the role of public art, architecture, landscaping, site design, and development patterns to enhance the visual image of Huntington Beach.

Policy LU-1C: Support infill development, consolidation of parcels, and adaptive reuse of existing buildings.

Policy LU-1D: Ensure that new development projects are of compatible proportion, scale, and character to complement adjoining uses.

Policy LU-2E: Intensify the use and strengthen the role of public art, architecture, landscaping, site design, and development patterns to enhance the visual image of Huntington Beach.

Goal LU-4: A range of housing types is available to meet the diverse economic, physical, and social needs of future and existing residents, while neighborhood character and residences are well maintained and protected.

Goal LU-4A: Encourage a mix of residential types to accommodate people with diverse housing needs.

Goal LU-11B: Encourage new businesses to locate on existing vacant or underutilized commercial properties where these properties have good locations and accessibility.

Goal LU-12B: Encourage renovation and revitalization of deteriorating and struggling nonresidential areas and corridors, particularly commercial locations.

The new four-story senior care community project is an infill development on two underutilized commercial properties that would assist in meeting the overall housing needs of the community. In addition, the proposed convalescent facility is compatible in proportion, scale, and character of the surrounding land uses because the proposed building is similar in height and massing to other multi-story senior living facilities in the City that are adjacent to residential uses and incorporates high quality architectural design. The project designed reflect a traditional style of architecture that is reflective of the City's beach lifestyle that complements and enhances the architectural style of the larger surrounding area. A variety of building materials, multilevel rooflines, and varying building setbacks along the Warner and Bolsa Chica frontages are incorporated into the proposed design and are intended to break up the scale and massing of the building. Landscaping includes a variety of tree and plant species and is designed to complement the architecture, frame the building elements, and be consistent with the overall character of the surrounding area. Lastly, the proposed

convalescent facility supports the provision of a mix of housing types that meet the diverse economic, social, and housing needs of the community.

Noise Element

Goal N-1: Noise-sensitive land uses are protected in areas with acceptable noise levels.

Policy N-1B: Incorporate design and construction features into residential, mixed-use, commercial, and industrial projects that shield noise-sensitive land uses from excessive noise.

Goal N-2: Land use patterns are compatible with current and future noise levels.

Goal N-3B: Prioritize use of site planning and project design techniques to mitigate excessive noise. The use of noise barriers shall be considered a means of achieving the noise standards only after all other practical design-related noise mitigation measures have been integrated into the project.

The proposed project would introduce a quasi-residential land use on a property currently developed with commercial office and retail uses. The proposed project's design incorporates the existing configuration of the project site to maintain acceptable stationary noise levels at existing noise-sensitive land uses by placing outdoor amenities and vehicle parking associated with the use behind or beneath the primary structure so as to attenuate potential off-site noise impacts. Additionally, a new 8-foot high masonry wall would be installed along the project site's southern boundary and operational noise levels would not exceed the City's exterior daytime or nighttime noise standards as established in the Municipal Code. Further, the use of modern construction methods and materials will reduce vehicle noise from the adjacent roadways, and the building design and siting is proposed to enclose the future residents' common open space courtyards to minimize any roadway noise from Warner Avenue and Bolsa Chica Street.

Housing Element

Goal H1: Maintain and enhance the quality and affordability of existing housing in Huntington Beach.

Policy H1.1: Preserve the character, scale, and quality of established residential neighborhoods.

Goal H2: Provide adequate housing sites through appropriate land use, zoning, and specific plan designations to accommodate Huntington Beach's share of regional housing needs.

Policy H2.1: Provide site opportunities for development of housing that responds to diverse community needs in terms of housing types, cost, and location emphasizing locations near services and transit that promote walkability.

Policy 2.2 – Facilitate the efficient use of land by allowing and encouraging commercial and residential uses on the same property in both horizontal and vertical mixed-use configurations.

The proposed project is designed to reflect a traditional style of architecture that is reflective of the City's beach lifestyle and complements and enhances the surrounding areas. The project includes high quality design, architecture, and materials that is consistent with the overall character of the surrounding neighborhoods. The proposed senior care community would add 159 units of senior living capacity in a facility that includes on-site amenities for

residents including recreational areas, exercise areas, dining, and entertainment options that reduce the need for residents to travel off-site. Additionally, multiple nearby commercial businesses are within walking distance of the project site, and for those services that aren't, van services would be provided to residents to access additional adjacent commercial uses including restaurants, medical offices, and pharmacies.

3. The request to demolish 50,000 sq. ft. of existing commercial space and construct a new four-story 215,000 sq. ft. convalescent facility with on-site alcohol sales and consumption at a maximum overall height of 49.5 ft., consisting of 159 total units, a subterranean parking garage, and associated hardscape and landscape improvements on a property with a grade differential above three feet that involves the excavation of more than 25,000 cubic yards of soil will comply with the provisions of the base district and other applicable provisions in Titles 20-25 of the Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance (HBZSO) because the new structure is designed to comply with all Specific Plan development standards, including building setbacks, maximum building height, and on-site parking. The proposed convalescent facility with an ancillary Type 47 ABC alcohol license for residents and guests is allowed in the Bolsa Chica Senior Care Community Specific Plan. Additionally, the project has been designed to accommodate the site's existing grade and topographical features in a manner that is consistent with the scale and character of the surrounding land uses, and will not result in an adverse impact upon implementation.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL – CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 21-024:

1. The site plan, floor plans, and elevations received and dated August 20, 2024 shall be the conceptually approved design with the following modifications:
 - a. The adequacy and type of any upper story bird safe window treatments, including, but not limited to, fritted or patterned windows, UV pattern film, window nets and/or window screens shall be reviewed and approved by the Community Development Department.
2. The use shall comply with the following:
 - a. Prior to the sales, service, or consumption of alcoholic beverages, the facility shall obtain an ABC license authorizing alcohol use. **(PD)**
 - b. An employee of the establishment must monitor all areas where alcohol is served. **(PD)**
 - c. All areas of the facility where sales, service, and consumption of alcoholic beverages occur shall be equipped with lighting sufficient to power and illuminate and permit the identification of patrons. **(PD)**
 - d. All alcoholic beverages shall remain within the perimeter of the facility. **(PD)**
 - e. Consumption of alcoholic beverages by all on-duty employees, including servers, bartenders, management, and supervisory personnel is forbidden. **(PD)**
 - f. All persons engaged in the sale or service of alcohol shall complete a mandatory Responsible Beverage Service (RBS) training and certification. This shall be required for new employees within 60 days of being hired and for existing employees every 12 months. Training shall be provided by an ABC approved RBS trainer and records of the training must be maintained on-site for review. **(PD)**

- a. All improvements shall be completed in accordance with approved plans, and all Mitigation Measures must be satisfied before issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy.
 - b. Compliance with all conditions of approval specified herein shall be verified by the Community Development Department.
 - c. All building spoils, such as unusable lumber, wire, pipe, and other surplus or unusable material, shall be disposed of at an off-site facility equipped to handle them.
 - d. All Development Impact Fees shall be paid to the Community Development Department (*City of Huntington Beach Community Development Department Fee Schedule*). **(HBZSO Section 254.16)**.
7. During demolition, grading, site development, and/or construction, the following shall be adhered to:
- a. Construction equipment shall be maintained in peak operating condition to reduce emissions.
 - b. Use low sulfur (0.5%) fuel by weight for construction equipment.
 - c. Truck idling shall be prohibited for periods longer than 10 minutes.
 - d. Attempt to phase and schedule activities to avoid high ozone days first stage smog alerts.
 - e. Discontinue operation during second stage smog alerts.
 - f. Ensure clearly visible signs are posted on the perimeter of the site identifying the name and phone number of a field supervisor to contact for information regarding the development and any construction/grading activity.
8. Conditional Use Permit No. 21-024 shall not become effective until General Plan Amendment No. 21-004, Zoning Map Amendment No. 22-003, and Zoning Text Amendment No. 22-005 has been approved by the City Council and is in effect. **(HBZSO Section 247.16)**
9. Conditional Use Permit No. 21-024 shall become null and void unless exercised within two years of the date of final approval or such extension of time as may be granted by the Director pursuant to a written request submitted to the Community Development Department a minimum 30 days prior to the expiration date.
10. The Development Services Departments and divisions (Building & Safety, Fire, Planning and Public Works) shall be responsible for ensuring compliance with all applicable code requirements and conditions of approval. The Director of Community Development may approve minor amendments to plans and/or conditions of approval as appropriate based on changed circumstances, new information or other relevant factors. Any proposed plan/project revisions shall be called out on the plan sets submitted for building permits. Permits shall not be issued until the Development Services Departments have reviewed and approved the proposed changes for conformance with the intent of the Planning Commission's action. If the proposed changes are of a substantial nature, an amendment to the original entitlement reviewed by the Planning Commission may be required pursuant to the provisions of HBZSO Section 241.18.

REQUEST:

CUP: To permit the construction of a four-story mixed-use project consisting of ground floor podium parking and 1,000 sq. ft. of commercial space, and 15 residential units on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floors in the Neighborhood Boulevard Segment of the Beach and Edinger Corridors Specific Plan (SP14), with reduced front yard setbacks along the Beach Blvd. and Speer Drive frontages.

LOCATION:

7942 Speer Drive, 92647 (Southwest corner of Beach Boulevard at Speer Drive)

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

That the Planning Commission take the following actions:

- A) Find the proposed project exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15182 of the CEQA Guidelines and Government Code 65457.
- B) Approve Conditional Use Permit No. 23-007 with findings and conditions of approval (Attachment No. 1).

The Commission made the following disclosures:

- Commissioner Adam had no disclosures.
- Commissioner Pellman had no disclosures.
- Vice-Chair Kennedy had no disclosures.
- Chair Twining had no disclosures.
- Commissioner Wood spoke the applicant and with staff.
- Commissioner Rodriguez had no disclosures
- Commissioner Acosta-Galvan spoke with staff.

Hayden Beckman, Senior Planner, gave the staff presentation of the proposed project.

There was discussion on the following items: the proposed level of affordable housing, the documented history of nuisance calls on the property, the proposed frontage improvements on Speer Drive and Beach Boulevard, onsite parking, setbacks, the location of pedestrian walkways onsite, the allowed first floor business uses, the maximum stories allowed, and the MAND in the specific plan area.

THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS OPENED.

Bac Pham, resident, spoke in support of Item No. 24-683, citing the benefits of having a building on the site rather than a vacant lot.

Connie Nguyen, resident, spoke in support of Item No. 24-683, citing the nuisances at the currently vacant site and the positive impacts of having residences on the site.

Lea Serrano, resident, spoke in support of Item No. 24-683, citing the benefits of new residential buildings, including energy efficiency.

Ann Palmer, resident, spoke in opposition to Item No. 24-683, citing concerns with the negative impacts to adjacent residents, the proposed setbacks, the proposed building heights, and requested concessions.

Anthony Tran, resident, spoke in support of Item No. 24-683, stating that this proposed project will allow his children to stay in Huntington Beach. He stated that the project will enhance the image of the city.

WITH NO ONE ELSE PRESENT TO SPEAK, THE PUBLIC HEARING WAS CLOSED.

There was lengthy discussion on the following items: the proposed setbacks, the proposed parking and drive aisle, residential privacy standards, the proposed building height, nuisance abatement issues in neighborhood, and the current parking situation in the neighborhood.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY ADAM, SECONDED BY WOOD, TO FIND THE PROPOSED PROJECT EXEMPT FROM THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA) PURSUANT TO SECTION 15182 OF THE CEQA GUIDELINES AND GOVERNMENT CODE 65457; AND APPROVE CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 23-007 WITH FINDINGS AND CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Adam, Wood, Rodriguez, Acosta-Galvan
NOES: Pellman, Kennedy, Twining
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

MOTION PASSED

FINDINGS FOR PROJECTS EXEMPT FROM CEQA:

The Planning Commission finds that the project will not have any significant effect on the environment and is exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to section 15182 of the CEQA Guidelines and Government Code 65457, because the project is a mixed use development that conforms to the BECSP for which Program EIR No. 08-008 was adopted, and implementation of the project would not result in any new or more severe potentially adverse environmental impacts that were not considered in the Final EIR for the BECSP. The project is required to comply with all applicable mitigation measures adopted for BECSP. The applicant prepared a Consistency Evaluation for the project in comparison with the analysis of EIR No. 08-008 that concludes that in light of the whole record, none of the circumstances described under Section 15162 of the CEQA Guidelines are present and, therefore, no EIR or MND is required.

FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL – CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 23-007:

1. Conditional Use Permit No. 23-007 to permit the construction of a four-story mixed-use project consisting of ground floor covered parking and 1,000 sq. ft. of commercial space, and 15 residential units on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floors will not be detrimental to the general welfare of persons working or residing in the vicinity or detrimental to the value of the property and improvements in the neighborhood. The proposed mixed-use project incorporates architectural

and design principles to help ensure maximum compatibility of design within the existing Beach and Edinger Corridors Specific Plan area, promotes pedestrian-friendly entries and uses, and promotes the use of high-quality exterior building materials and finishes. The structure has been designed to provide varied articulation to provide sufficient reductions in overall building massing. Development standards and design guidelines in the Specific Plan ensure that form, height, and development convey an overall high level of quality, including reduced front yard setbacks that activate pedestrian access on the corner parcel. Landscaping and hardscape patterns will be compatible with the surrounding residential neighborhood and commercial corridor along Beach Boulevard. The project enhances the pedestrian circulation and pedestrian-oriented streetscapes throughout the Plan area.

2. Conditional Use Permit No. 23-007 will not adversely affect the Circulation Plan in that the project will enable modern improvements to an existing vacant site that will provide new pedestrian access and vehicle parking that will mitigate vehicle congestion with adjacent land uses. The proposed circulation pattern centralizes passenger vehicle access on and off the site and provides adequate parking for the proposed development designed to be contained under, behind, and adjacent to a new building with a high level of quality architecture and site design to screen a majority of the parking area from public view. The proposed mixed-use project incorporates improved access and circulation for future residents, their visitors, and commercial visitors.
3. The proposed project will comply with the provisions of the Neighborhood Boulevard Segment development standards contained within the Beach and Edinger Corridors Specific Plan and other applicable provisions in Titles 20-25 of the Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance. The proposed project meets statutory and code requirements in terms of building massing, architectural design, landscaping, private open space and parking. Reduced front yard setbacks are permitted subject to the review and approval of the Planning Commission.
4. Conditional Use Permit No. 23-007 for the construction of a four-story mixed-use project consisting of ground floor podium parking and 1,000 sq. ft. of commercial space with reduced front yard setbacks, and 15 residential units on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floors will be consistent with the proposed General Plan Land Use designation of M-sp (Mixed Use – Specific Plan Overlay) and would be consistent with the following goals and policies of the General Plan:

A. Land Use Element

Goal LU-1 - New commercial, industrial, and residential development is coordinated to ensure that the land use pattern is consistent with the overall goals and needs of the community.

Policy LU-1A – Ensure that development is consistent with the land use designations presented in the Land Use Map, including density, intensity, and use standards applicable to each land use designation.

Policy LU-1C - Support infill development, consolidation of parcels, and adaptive reuse of existing buildings.

Policy LU-1D - Ensure that new development projects are of compatible proportion, scale and character to complement adjoining uses.

Policy LU-2E - Intensify the use and strengthen the role of public art, architecture, landscaping, site design, and development patterns to enhance the visual image of Huntington Beach.

Goal LU-4 - A range of housing types is available to meet the diverse economic, physical, and social needs of future and existing residents, while neighborhood character and residences are well maintained and protected.

Policy LU-4A – Encourage a mix of residential types to accommodate people with diverse housing needs.

Policy LU-4B – Improve options for people to live near work and public transit.

Policy LU-4E – Encourage housing options located in proximity to employment to reduce vehicle miles traveled.

Goal LU-7 - Neighborhoods, corridors, and community subareas are well designed, and buildings, enhanced streets, and public spaces contribute to a strong sense of place.

The project will redevelop an infill site with a mixed-use development to address the diverse residential and commercial needs of the community. It will be compatible with the character of the neighborhood which consists of a mix of medium density residential and commercial uses along the Beach Boulevard corridor. It will provide additional opportunities for housing near employment and public transit. The architectural design of the proposed 4-story project includes an upper story setback on all sides that will reduce the overall massing and bulk of the development, increasing compatibility with and enhancing the character of adjoining uses. It is consistent with the development standards in BECSP and Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance (HBZSO) except for reduced front yard setbacks, and a concession to special height limits adjacent to existing housing permitted under the California Density Bonus Law.

B. Housing Element

Goal 2 - Provide adequate housing sites through appropriate land use, zoning and specific plan designations to accommodate Huntington Beach's share of regional housing needs.

Policy 2.1 - Provide site opportunities for development of housing that responds to diverse community needs in terms of housing types, cost and location, emphasizing locations near services and transit that promote walkability.

Policy 2.3 – Encourage and facilitate the provision of housing affordable to lower income households within the Beach and Edinger Corridors Specific Plan.

Goal 3 - Enhance housing affordability so that modest income households can remain an integral part of the Huntington Beach community.

Policy 3.1 - Encourage the production of housing that meets all economic segments of the community, including lower, moderate, and upper income households, to maintain a balanced community.

Policy 3.2 - Utilize the City's Inclusionary Housing Ordinance as a tool to integrate affordable units within market rate developments. Continue to prioritize the construction of affordable units on-site, with provision of units off-site or payment of an in-lieu housing fee as a less preferred alternative.

Policy 3.3 - Facilitate the development of affordable housing through regulatory incentives and concessions, and/or financial assistance, with funding priority to projects that include extremely low income units. Proactively seek out new models and approaches in the provision of affordable housing.

Policy 3.4 - Explore collaborative partnerships with non-profit organizations, developers, the business community and governmental agencies in the provision of affordable housing.

Policy 4.1 - Support the use of density bonuses and other incentives, such as fee deferrals/waivers and parking reductions, to offset or reduce the costs of developing affordable housing while ensuring that potential impacts are addressed.

Policy 6.4 – Incorporate transit and other transportation alternatives including walking and bicycling into the design of new development, particularly in areas within a half mile of designated transit stops.

The project will redevelop a vacant commercial property with a project that will provide additional residential opportunities in a mixed-use configuration along Beach Boulevard to address the diverse housing needs of the community. The project will comply with the City's affordable housing requirement to provide 10 percent of the proposed dwelling units as affordable units. Due to the provision of affordable housing, the applicant is entitled to reduced parking and any concessions and waivers as permitted by the California Density Bonus Law. The project is located near transit, employment, and services which can facilitate alternative forms of transportation.

C. Circulation Element

Goal CIRC-3A – Convenient and efficient connections between regional transit and areas of employment, shopping, recreation, and housing will increase ridership and active mobility, with a focus on first/last mile solutions.

Policy CIRC-6C – Require new commercial and residential projects to integrate with pedestrian and bicycle networks, and that necessary land area is provided for the infrastructure.

The project site is located near public transportation, employment, and shopping. The project will be installing Palm Tree Boulevard frontage improvements including a 6 ft. wide sidewalk and 4 ft. planter along Beach Boulevard, and Neighborhood Streets frontage improvements including up to a 12 ft. wide sidewalk along Speer Drive, as required by BECSP. Combined with the bike racks that will be provided onsite, these improvements will facilitate active mobility and could increase transit ridership.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL – CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 23-007:

1. The site plan, floor plans, and elevations received and dated May 16, 2024 shall be the conceptually approved layout with the following modifications:
 - a. Private balconies for Units 1, 2, 7 & 8 shall be minimum 60 sq. ft in size.
 - b. Exposed surface parking areas shall include moderate screening and provide minimum 2 ft. wide planted landscape areas along the property line.

- c. The site plan shall indicate the loading and unloading areas for resident move-in/out.
2. Prior to issuance of building permits, an Affordable Housing Agreement in accordance with the Affordable Housing Program shall be submitted to the Community Development for review and approval by the City Attorney and accepted by the City Council. Said agreement shall be recorded with the Orange County Recorder's Office prior to issuance of the first building permit for the project. The Agreement shall comply with HBZSO Section 230.14 and include, but not be limited to, the following items:
 - a. That the affordable units shall be at minimum offered as low income units;
 - b. The duration of the affordability and the number of the affordable units;
 - c. The method in which the developer and the City are to monitor the affordability of the subject affordable units and the eligibility of the tenants or owners of those units over the period of the agreement;
 - d. The method in which vacancies will be marketed and filled;
 - e. A description of the location and unit type (bedrooms, floor area, etc.) of the affordable units within the project. Affordable units shall be located throughout the project and shall include a mixture of unit types in the same ratio as provided throughout the project; and
 - f. Standards for maximum qualifying household incomes and standards for maximum rents or sales prices.
3. Prior to issuance of building permits, the following shall be completed:
 - a. Block wall/fencing plans (including a site plan, section drawings, and elevations depicting the height and material of all retaining walls, walls, and fences) consistent with the grading plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Community Development Department. Double walls shall be avoided to the greatest extent feasible. Prior to the construction of any new walls, a plan must be submitted identifying the removal of any existing walls located on the subject property. The plans shall identify materials, seep holes and drainage.
 - b. Contact the United States Postal Service for approval of mailbox location(s).
 - c. An interim parking and building materials storage plan shall be submitted to the Community Development Department to assure adequate parking and restroom facilities are available for employees, customers, and contractors during the project's construction phase and that adjacent properties will not be impacted by their location. The plan shall also be reviewed and approved by the Fire Department and Public Works Department. The applicant shall obtain any necessary encroachment permits from the Department of Public Works.
4. The Developer shall provide a Landscape Maintenance Agreement for the continuing maintenance and liability of all landscaping, irrigation, street lighting, furniture, and hardscape that is located along the project frontage within the public right of way and pedestrian access easements. The agreement shall describe all aspects of maintenance such as enhanced sidewalk cleaning, weed and pest control, trash cans, disposal of trash, signs, tree or palm replacement, and any other aspect of maintenance that is warranted by the improvements proposed. The agreement shall state that the property ownership shall be responsible for all costs associated with maintenance (including any fees for water and electrical use), repair, replacement, liability, and fees imposed by the City. **(PW)**

5. During demolition, grading, site development, and/or construction, the following shall be adhered to:
 - a. Construction equipment shall be maintained in peak operating condition to reduce emissions.
 - b. Use low sulfur (0.5%) fuel by weight for construction equipment.
 - c. Truck idling shall be prohibited for periods longer than 10 minutes.
 - d. Attempt to phase and schedule activities to avoid high ozone days first stage smog alerts.
 - e. Discontinue operation during second stage smog alerts.
 - f. Ensure clearly visible signs are posted on the perimeter of the site identifying the name and phone number of a field supervisor to contact for information regarding the development and any construction/grading activity.
 - g. All Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance and Municipal Code requirements including the Noise Ordinance. All activities including truck deliveries associated with construction, grading, remodeling, or repair shall be limited to Monday-Saturday 7:00 AM to 7:00 PM. Such activities are prohibited Sundays and Federal holidays **(HBMC 8.40.090)**.
6. The structure cannot be occupied, the final building permit cannot be approved, and utilities cannot be released for the first residential unit until the following have been completed:
 - a. Comply with all applicable mitigation measures adopted in conjunction with Final EIR No. 08-008 (Beach and Edinger Corridors Specific Plan).
 - b. The applicant shall obtain the necessary permits from the South Coast Air Quality Management District and submit a copy to Community Development Department **(AQMD Rule 1403)**.
 - c. Compliance with all conditions of approval specified herein shall be accomplished and verified by the Community Development Department.
 - d. All building spoils, such as unusable lumber, wire, pipe, and other surplus or unusable material, shall be disposed of at an off-site facility equipped to handle them.
 - e. All Development Impact Fees shall be paid to the Community Development Department (*City of Huntington Beach Community Development Department Fee Schedule*). **(HBZSO Section 254.16)**.
7. Signage shall be reviewed under separate permits and applicable processing pursuant to Section 233 of the HBZSO.
8. The applicant and/or applicant's representative shall be responsible for ensuring the accuracy of all plans and information submitted to the City for review and approval.
9. The development services departments (Community Development Department, Fire Department, and Public Works) shall be responsible for ensuring compliance with all

applicable code requirements and conditions of approval. The Director of Community Development may approve minor amendments to plans and/or conditions of approval as appropriate based on changed circumstances, new information or other relevant factors. Any proposed plan/project revisions shall be called out on the plan sets submitted for building permits. Permits shall not be issued until the Development Services Departments have reviewed and approved the proposed changes for conformance with the intent of the Planning Commission's action. If the proposed changes are of a substantial nature, an amendment to the original entitlement reviewed by the Planning Commission may be required pursuant to the provisions of HBZSO Section 241.18.

10. Conditional Use Permit No. 23-007 shall become null and void unless exercised within two years of the date of final approval or such extension of time as may be granted by the Director pursuant to a written request submitted to the Community Development Department a minimum 30 days prior to the expiration date.
11. The Planning Commission reserves the right to revoke Conditional Use Permit No. 23-007 pursuant to a public hearing for revocation, if any violation of the conditions of approval, Huntington Beach Zoning and Subdivision Ordinance, or Municipal Code occurs.

INDEMNIFICATION AND HOLD HARMLESS CONDITION:

The owner of the property which is the subject of this project and the project applicant if different from the property owner, and each of their heirs, successors and assigns, shall defend, indemnify and hold harmless the City of Huntington Beach and its agents, officers, and employees from any claim, action or proceedings, liability cost, including attorney's fees and costs against the City or its agents, officers or employees, to attack, set aside, void or annul any approval of the City, including but not limited to any approval granted by the City Council, Planning Commission, or Design Review Board concerning this project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any claim, action or proceeding and should cooperate fully in the defense thereof.

CONSENT CALENDAR

24-591 APPROVE PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES DATED JULY 23, 2024

Recommended Action:

That the Planning Commission take the following action:

"Approve the July 23, 2024, Planning Commission Minutes as submitted."

A MOTION WAS MADE BY WOOD, SECONDED BY ADAM, TO APPROVE THE JULY 23, 2024, PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES AS SUBMITTED, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Adam, Kennedy, Twining, Wood, Rodriguez

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

ABSTAIN: Pellman, Acosta-Galvan

MOTION APPROVED

24-682 APPROVE PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES DATED SEPTEMBER 10, 2024

Recommended Action:

That the Planning Commission take the following action:

"Approve the September 10, 2024, Planning Commission Minutes as submitted."

A MOTION WAS MADE BY WOOD, SECONDED BY TWINING, TO APPROVE THE SEPTEMBER 10, 2024, PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES AS SUBMITTED, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Adam, Pellman, Kennedy, Twining, Wood, Rodriguez

NOES: None

ABSENT: None

ABSTAIN: Acosta-Galvan

MOTION APPROVED

NON-PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS - NONE

PLANNING ITEMS - NONE

PLANNING COMMISSION ITEMS

Commissioner Rodriguez expressed disappointment in Commissioner Kennedy's motion to force recusal and thanked the City Attorney's office for confirming his right to vote on tonight's items.

Commissioner Pellman reported on the recent Historic Resources Board meeting.

ADJOURNMENT: Adjourned at 8:32 PM to the next regularly scheduled meeting of Tuesday, October 8, 2024.

APPROVED BY:

Jennifer Villasenor, Secretary

Butch Twining, Chairperson